

Paris
July 22, 2003

Mr. Ian Johnson
CGIAR Chairman
and
Mr. Francisco Reifschneider
CGIAR Director

The World Bank
1818 H St., NW
Washington DC 20433

Dear Ian and Francisco,

I am writing on behalf of the Search and Nomination Committee for the CGIAR Science Council (SNC-SC).

During the past few months, the Committee has conducted an open, transparent, and global search for the Chair and Members of the Science Council--as per the process agreed upon in January 2003, and shared with the key CGIAR stakeholders. The Committee has undertaken a comprehensive review and analysis of over 360 CVs; and a shortlist of 28 candidates was agreed upon. Interviews of the 28 candidates on the shortlist were conducted on May 5-6 and July 21-22 in Paris.

I am pleased to forward to you the unanimous recommendations of the Committee for the positions of Chair and Members of the Science Council. A detailed report is attached, and will be supplemented next week with a one-page CV of each of the proposed candidates. I would be pleased to provide any additional information if needed.

We greatly appreciate this opportunity to contribute to the formation of the Science Council and the continued strengthening of the CGIAR.

Sincerely,

Sd/-

Mohamed Hassan
Chair,
Search and Nominations Committee for the Science Council

Cc: SNC-SC Members

CONFIDENTIAL

**Report of the Search and Nomination Committee
for the Science Council**

To: the CGIAR Executive Council

Mohamed Hassan (Chair)
Mutsuo Iwamoto
Gurdev Khush
Dietrich Leihner
Marilia Nutti
Berit Olsson
Jules Pretty
Steven Slack

July 22, 2003
Paris

CONFIDENTIAL

Report of the Search and Nomination Committee for the Science Council

To: the CGIAR Executive Council

Terms of Reference

The Search and Nomination Committee for the Science Council (SNC-SC) was established by the CGIAR Executive Council (ExCo) to help it recruit:

- a) A Chairperson of outstanding leadership quality and internationally recognized eminence;
- b) Six Members of recognized excellence and expertise in science and policy; and
- c) For the first year of operation, two members of the interim SC (iSC) who would participate as Members.

Search Process

The proposed search process was outlined in the “process note” of 28 January 2003, which was circulated by the SNC-SC to key CGIAR stakeholders for comment [no comments or suggestions were received]. Accordingly:

- a) The Committee has undertaken an open, transparent, and global search process for the SC Chair and Members;
- b) Nominations and applications have been sought from individuals and leading scientific organizations, worldwide, using a variety of means--including call for nominations/applications, advertisements in science journals and newspapers, and targeted search by SNC-SC members and others;
- c) The call for nominations/applications was based on the SC functions endorsed by the CGIAR/ExCo; and
- d) The criteria utilized for assessing candidates were as per the report of the Science Council Working Group, endorsed by the CGIAR/ExCo in Fall 2002.

Selection Criteria

The SNC-SC has used the following selection criteria for screening and short-listing applications for both Chair and Members:

A. Scientific Expertise and Experience:

1. Eminence in a field of biological, physical or social science
2. International recognition of research achievements
3. Experience with a cross-disciplinary approach to scientific research
4. A good understanding of policy dimensions in development, including relationships between developing and developed countries and institutions therein
5. Broad knowledge of agriculture (crops and livestock), natural resource management. Fisheries and forestry in the context of sustainable development, poverty reduction, and the global environment

6. An understanding of the CGIAR System

B. Leadership and Management Attributes:

1. A visionary leader, with global perspective and outstanding communication skills
2. The ability to think strategically and analyze complex issues
3. Management experience, particularly in directing high level scientific talent and setting priorities
4. Capacity to lead the SC and provide guidance to its secretariat.

For assessing individuals, the quality of candidates has been the over-riding consideration. For the SC as a whole, disciplinary, gender-, age, and geographical diversity has also been taken into consideration.

For the iSC members continuing on the SC, emphasis has been given to knowledge of the CGIAR; a broad understanding of agriculture and development issues; and ability to help the SC address outstanding issues, e.g., those related to Challenge Programs.

Applications Screening and Short-listing

Over 340 applications were received by mid-April. Preliminary screening narrowed this to a “long list” of 16 potentially suitable candidates for Chair and 50 for Member positions. The list for Chair included 12 male and 4 female candidates, from 13 countries covering all Regions, from a variety of disciplinary backgrounds. The list for Members showed similar diversity. It included 39 male and 11 female candidates, from 31 countries, and represented a large variety of disciplinary backgrounds.

SNC-SC members, through several iterations by e-mail, reduced the long-list to a “preliminary short-list” of 21 candidates, including 8 who had indicated an initial interest in the Chair position. This list included 5 female candidates and 9 from developing countries. Twenty candidates were interviewed in Paris by the SNC-SC on May 5-6 (one SNC member was unable to attend due to an unavoidable prior commitment). Ten candidates were interviewed in person, 9 by telephone, and 1 by video.

After intensive discussions the Committee concluded that additional time was needed to gather more information for a thorough assessment of the interviewed candidates, and to redress gaps in the overall profile with additional strong candidates. The Committee received additional nominations, of which 8 were selected for interview, including one for Chair and 7 for Member. These candidates were interviewed by the SNC in Paris on July 21-22 (the Chair candidate and two member candidates were interviewed in person).

Recommendations

The Committee unanimously recommends three options for Chair and Membership of the Science Council in order of priority. All candidates for Chair and Member of the SC have been selected on the basis of scientific merit and international standing.

Each option has a different Chair. The top-ranked candidate for Chair is Per Pinstrup-Andersen (option I), followed by Michael Gale (option II), and Ken Fischer (option III).

Option I	Option II	Option III
Chair: Per Pinstrup-Andersen (Denmark)	Chair: Michael Gale (UK)	Chair: Kenneth Fischer (Australia)
Virender Chopra (India) Michael Gale (UK) Keiji Kainuma (Japan) Onesmo ole-MoiYoi (Kenya) Terezina Padilha (Brazil) Lisa Sennerby-Forsse (Sweden)	Keith Bezanson (Canada) Virender Chopra (India) Keiji Kainuma (Japan) Onesmo ole-MoiYoi (Kenya) Terezina Padilha (Brazil) Lisa Sennerby-Forsse (Sweden)	Virender Chopra (India) Keiji Kainuma (Japan) Michael Lipton (UK) Onesmo ole-MoiYoi (Kenya) Terezina Padilha (Brazil) Lisa Sennerby-Forsse (Sweden)

Back-up list for all three options
Johannes Bouma (Netherlands) Kenneth Cassman (USA) Christopher Chetsanga (Zimbabwe) Barbara Ekbom (Sweden) Michel Griffon (France) Luis Herrera-Estrella (México) Qifa Zhang (China) + Keith Bezanson (Canada) Kenneth Fischer (Australia) Michael Lipton (UK)

The list of six Members in each option is a composite grouping and the names are listed alphabetically. Five of the Member candidates are common to all three options. The Committee makes this proposal because of these candidates' outstanding qualifications and expertise.

While maintaining the scientific quality of the proposed Council, the composite lists of proposed names seek to balance gender, discipline and geography.

Should any proposed member not be able to accept their appointment, the above back-up list of ten members provides alternatives. Three of these (Bezanson, Fischer and Lipton) are included in options II and III. Names are provided in alphabetical order. Additional information on each candidate is attached.

In addition, the SNC-SC recommends the following ranked short-list of **iSC Members**, two of whom could be appointed to the Science Council for a period of one year:

1. Gregersen, Hans (USA)
2. de Janvry, Alain (France)

3. Harwood, Richard (USA)
4. Fereres, Elias (Spain).

Observations on the Recommendations

The Committee noted that the announcement for the position of Chair indicated that the post would be close to full-time. However, the proposed chair for option I has argued that the position for the Chair of the SC can be successfully accomplished on a roughly half-time basis. This would enable the candidate to maintain stronger ties with other institutions whilst ensuring independence and autonomy.

This Committee considers that the top-ranked Chair candidate (Pinstrup-Andersen) is worth serious consideration, and recommends that the CGIAR negotiate with him, to ensure that the post of Chair of the Science Council would be his primary task.

The SNC-SC noted the need to maintain key iSC activities during the transition period. It suggests that ExCo consider options to ensure that existing activities, particularly on impact assessment, be continued until the new Science Council commences its work.

Additional Information on Proposed Candidates for Science Council

Name	Nationality	Gender	Age	Discipline
Chair Candidates <i>(in rank order)</i>				
Per Pinstруп-Andersen	Denmark	M	64	Agricultural economics
Michael Gale	UK	M	60	Crop science, plant molecular genetics
Kenneth Fischer	Australia	M	58	Crop science/physiology
Member Candidates <i>(in alphabetical order)</i>				
Keith Bezanson <i>(in option II)</i>	Canada	M	62	International development/policy
Virender Chopra	India	M	67	Agricultural biotechnology/genetics
Keiji Kainuma	Japan	M	66	Biochemistry, enzymology
Michael Lipton <i>(in option III)</i>	UK	M	66	Economics of poverty reduction
Onesmo ole-MoiYoi	Kenya	M	60	Medical research, biotechnology
Terezinha Padilha	Brazil	F	51	Animal health and food safety
Lisa Sennerby-Forsse	Sweden	F	54	Forestry, plant physiology and anatomy
Backup List <i>(for all three options; in alphabetical order)</i>				
Johannes Bouma	Netherlands	M	63	Applied soil physics, ecology
Kenneth Cassman	USA	M	48	Agronomy and soil science
Christopher Chetsanga	Zimbabwe	M	67	Molecular biology and biotechnology
Barbara Ekbon	Sweden	F	53	Entomology, insect population dynamics
Michel Griffon	France	M	54	Agricultural economics
Luis Herrera-Estrella	Mexico	M	47	Molecular/cell biology
Qifa Zhang	China	M	50	Crop science, molecular genetics/breeding