

## **Terms of Reference for the ExCo Working Group on the Establishment of a CGIAR Science Council**

### **Background**

At MTM01, the CGIAR agreed to initiate a reform program, based on the recommendations of a Change Design and Management Team. One of the four agreed “pillars” of reform was the transformation of the CGIAR’s Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) into a Science Council. A Task Force on Science Council (TFSC) was appointed to propose terms of reference, composition, appointment process, and working procedures for the SC. The recommendations of the TFSC (along with those of similar task forces working on the other three pillars of reform) were considered by the CGIAR at AGM2001. The CGIAR took three decisions with respect to the Science Council at AGM2001. These related to: (1) role and primary responsibilities of the SC; (2) its size and the range of skills of its members; and (3) the Cosponsors’ role in financing the operations of the SC, including FAO’s hosting of the Council and its Secretariat, and the need for ExCo to establish a working group to prepare a detailed proposal on the transition to the SC. The full text of the CGIAR’s decisions at AGM 2001 and the revised attachment of the Interim ExCo integrated proposal on the Science Council responsibilities and composition, including the transition from TAC to Science Council, are attached (Attachments 1 and 2).

At its first meeting following AGM2001, the CGIAR Executive Council appointed an 11-member Interim Science Council for 2002, and the Chairman asked ExCo members to suggest terms-of-reference (TOR) points and candidates for the WGSC and the CGIAR Director to recommend a composition and TOR based on inputs received. (See Attachment 3 for an excerpt from the Summary Record of the first Executive Council meeting.) ExCo members made a number of suggestions for the TOR (see Attachment 4 for list of members who submitted comments and suggestions) and potential membership (see Attachment 5 for a list of individuals suggested, including those identified through the Secretariat’s Candidate Database.)

Based on the inputs received, the CGIAR Director recommends the following TOR and composition for the Working Group.

### **Expected Outputs**

The Working Group on the Establishment of a CGIAR Science Council (WGSC) is expected to generate the following outputs:

1. A clear definition of the specific areas of responsibility of the Science Council, in the light of the Council’s roles and functions agreed by the CGIAR at AGM01, namely, (1) to serve as guardian of the relevance and quality of science in the CGIAR, and (2) to advise the CGIAR on strategic scientific issues relevant to the Group’s goals and mission.

2. A detailed proposal on the alignment of the SC's functions with those of the Executive Council and System Office.
3. Recommendations for criteria and process for the selection of SC members, recognizing the dual imperatives of scientific excellence and the fulfillment of the CGIAR mission and purpose.
4. Guidelines for the operations of the SC, including its working modalities and ways in which it could mobilize global scientific expertise for peer-review and other science quality and relevance assurance mechanisms.
5. A plan of action on the operational and administrative aspects of the transition into SC. This should address issues related to the transition from the TAC Secretariat to the SC Secretariat, covering administrative, operational, personnel and financial aspects of the transition. Views of the Cosponsors (and their legal obligations) should be considered in preparing the recommended action plan.
6. A set of draft Rules of Procedure for the Science Council.

### **Timetable and Process**

- The WG should complete its work and submit a report by July 31, 2002 for consideration by the ExCo.
- The WG would meet at least once as a group and conduct most of its work through "virtual" means.
- The WG Chair would devote a significantly larger portion of his/her time to this task. This would involve at least one visit to FAO.
- The CGIAR Secretariat will provide a Secretary to backstop the WGSC.

### **Size and Appointment Process**

The WGSC will consist of up to seven (7) members including its Chair. A two stage process is recommended for appointment:

- Stage 1: CGIAR Director nominates the Chair of the WG for endorsement by the ExCo. A list of potential members are shared with the ExCo. ExCo members suggest additions to the "master list";
- Stage 2: WG Chair and the CGIAR Director jointly identify the membership of the WG from the "master list".

### **Composition**

As noted by the ExCo, this would be a hands-on working group made up of CGIAR members and experts on science networking, science policy formulation, assessment of

science quality (including peer reviews), and on administrative aspects of interagency collaboration. One member of the TFSC would be invited to join the WGSC.

List of Attachments:

1. Decisions Made by the CGIAR at AGM2001 on the Transformation of TAC into a Science Council
2. Excerpt from the Interim ExCo Integrated Proposal (Revised Attachment 5 of the Proposal): Science Council Responsibilities and Composition and Transition from TAC to Science Council
3. Excerpt from the Summary Record of the First Executive Council Meeting
4. Comments and Suggestions from ExCo Members
5. List of Individuals Suggested for Membership in the WGSC

**Decisions Made by the CGIAR at AGM2001  
On the Transformation of TAC into a Science Council**

**Decision 7:**

*The primary responsibilities of the Science Council will be: (a) to serve as guardian of relevance and quality of science in the CGIAR, and, (b) to advise the CGIAR on strategic scientific issues relevant to the Group's goals and mission. SC should also function as a strategic adviser to ExCo and its Program and Finance Committees and should ensure that a system of peer reviews is in place across the System. The functions of the SC and its roles and responsibilities of the SC in relation to CPs are as described in the integrated proposal.*

**Decision 8:**

*The SC will be composed of up to eight (8) individuals plus the Chair. The members should be eminent scientists in relevant disciplines in the biological, physical, and social sciences. While solid scientific stature should be a major selection criterion, the members of the Council should all have strong science policy and development experience, with the overall composition of the Council reflecting diversity in forms of science and understanding of science management. The size and the range of skills required of SC members should be kept under review by the ExCo.*

**Decision 9:**

*The SC and its Secretariat should have its operational costs covered by the Cosponsors and should be hosted by FAO. An agreement among Cosponsors covering the terms of FAO's hosting of the SC Secretariat should be prepared and formalized. This agreement should cover, among others, an institutional arrangement permitting greater latitude to the SC in recruitment of staff and provision of services to SC members while satisfying any legal obligations of FAO as host organization.*

*The present TAC should be phased out as of December 31, 2001 and an interim SC should be constituted at the beginning of 2002, when the transition from the TAC Secretariat to SC Secretariat would commence. The ExCo should establish a working group to prepare a detailed proposal for the financial, operational, conceptual, and administrative aspects of the transition from TAC to the SC, including its cost structure and mechanisms of financing. The transition arrangements recommended by the Science Council Task Force should be considered as background for the ExCo working group.*

**Excerpt from the Interim ExCo Integrated Proposal (Revised Attachment 5 of the Proposal): Science Council Responsibilities and Composition and Transition from TAC to Science Council**

**Responsibilities**

The primary responsibilities of the Science Council (SC) will be to:

- (a) serve as guardian of the relevance and quality of science in the CGIAR, and
- (b) advise the CGIAR on strategic scientific issues relevant to the Group's goals and mission. The SC should assist the ExCo and its Program and Finance committees by providing them with scientific advice on the strategic framework and set of priorities conducive to achieving CGIAR objectives.

Specifically, the SC would:

- (a) conduct periodic assessments of global and regional trends, scientific challenges, and research opportunities; and prepare the planning context at the System level;
- (b) provide a critical review of System-level strategic plans and the CGIAR project portfolio;
- (c) review challenge program proposals; mount peer review mechanisms, as necessary, for review of the proposals; and,
- (d) coordinate the CGIAR's science monitoring and evaluation (including oversight of the peer-review and other quality assurance mechanisms used by the Centers) as well as System-level impact assessment activities.

**Composition**

The SC will consist of up to eight (8) members plus the Chair. They should be eminent scientists in relevant disciplines in the biological, physical, and social sciences. While solid scientific stature should be a major selection criterion, members of the Council should all have strong science policy and development experience, with the overall composition of the SC reflecting diversity in forms of science and understanding of science management. The size and the range of skills required of SC members should be kept under review by the ExCo.

Search and selection of the SC Chair and members would be done through an open, global nomination process. The Cosponsors, serving as Nominating Committee, would submit a short list to the Executive Council, which in turn would make the final recommendation to the CGIAR. Serving on a full-time basis, the Chair would have a maximum five-year term, with an initial appointment of three years, which could be extended up to a total term of five years. A member's term would be for two years, renewable up to six years without further extension.

The SC would adopt, as a principal modus operandi, the mobilization of global scientific expertise from both industrialized and developing countries and the public and private sectors.

## **Transition from TAC to SC**

The present TAC will be phased out as of December 31, 2001. The ExCo will appoint an Interim SC for 2002, made up of the existing members of TAC who will not have completed their maximum terms (6 years) in 2001 and the Chair of SPIA.

The ExCo will appoint a 5-7 person Working Group (WG) to prepare a detailed proposal including composition of the SC, function, alignment with ExCo and Systems Office, operational and administrative aspects of the transition. The WG should also address issues related to the transition from the TAC Secretariat to the SC Secretariat. This would be a hands-on WG made up of CGIAR members, experts on science networking, science policy formulation, assessment of science quality (including peer reviews), and strong emphasis on administrative aspects of interagency collaboration. At least one member of the Science Council Task Force should participate in the WG.

The new members of the regular Science Council should be appointed at the latest by Annual General Meeting 2002 so they will be ready to assume office by January 2003. To provide for some degree of continuity among its membership, the terms of the initial members of the new Science Council could be staggered as follows:

- Three members for four years
- Three members for three years
- Two members for two years

Henceforth, the appointments of members will be for two years, renewable to a maximum of six years.

Membership of the current Standing Panel on Impact Assessment (SPIA) will be maintained until the regular SC can reconstitute the panel.

## **Transition from TAC Secretariat to SC Secretariat**

The present TAC Secretariat at FAO will be constituted as interim SC Secretariat effective January 1, 2002. A transition period of one year is suggested for the organization of the regular SC Secretariat. As early as possible during that period, a formal agreement covering the terms of FAO's hosting of the SC and SC Secretariat should be negotiated and signed among cosponsors. Such agreement would provide the legal framework for the organization of the regular SC Secretariat. This agreement should cover, among others, an institutional arrangement permitting greater latitude to the SC in recruitment of staff and provision of services to SC members, while satisfying any legal requirements of FAO as host organization.

The interim SC Secretariat would need to gear up to enable it to respond effectively to the new demands expected with the initiation of the process for the development and evaluation of challenge programs in 2002. The SC Chair and the Executive Secretary would institute changes in staff assignments as necessary and draw consultant expertise to fill the gaps.

**Excerpt from the Summary Record of the First Executive Council Meeting**

The meeting considered the steps outlined in the interim Executive Council (iEC) Integrated Proposal for the appointment of an interim Science Council (iSC) for 2002, and the CGIAR decision at AGM2001 to request the ExCo to create a Working Group (WG) to facilitate establishment of the permanent SC.

The following points were made in the course of the discussion:

- The meeting selected TAC Chair Emil Javier as Chair of the Interim SC, by acclamation.
- TAC had not been reviewed as proposed by the CDMT prior to the establishment of SC. The WG should consider the need for such a review.
- Cosponsors had not met to consider this issue, but expected to do so via video conference.
- The WG should seek the views of cosponsors and take these into account. The cosponsors could play a due diligence role.
- The alignment of proposals from the WG with FAO's legal requirements should be carefully examined.

In the light of these discussions, the process initially proposed by the CGIAR Secretariat was modified, particularly the deadlines for the steps proposed, and reads as follows:

**1.** ExCo appoints an 11-member Interim SC for 2002, made up of the existing members of TAC who will not have completed their maximum terms (6 years) in 2001 and the Chair of SPIA. These include: Messrs: M. Cernea, E. Fereres, M. Fernandes, H. Gregersen, R. Harwood, A. de Janvry, O. Niangado, H. Uchimiya, J. von Braun, V. T. Xuan, and U. B. Zehr.

**2.** ExCo appoints a 5-7 person WG to prepare a detailed proposal including composition, function, alignment with ExCo and Systems Office, operational and administrative aspects of the transition. The WG should also address issues related to the transition from the TAC Secretariat to the SC Secretariat. This would be a hands-on WG made up of CGIAR members, experts on science networking, science policy formulation, assessment of science quality (including peer reviews), and strong emphasis on administrative aspects of interagency collaboration. At least one member of the SCTF should participate in the WG.

**3.** Steps to appoint the WG:

- (a) ExCo members suggest TOR points and possible members to the CGIAR Director (by February 28);
- (b) CGIAR Director recommends WG composition and TOR based on inputs received (by March 21);
- (c) Following endorsement of ExCo, WG is appointed and begins work (April 1).

**Comments and Suggestions from ExCo Members**

The following members of the Council provided comments and suggestions on possible elements of the terms of reference and composition of the working group on the establishment of a CGIAR Science Council:

1. Robert Herdt (Rockefeller Foundation)- (comments received on Dec. 31, 2001)
2. John Vercoe (CBC) – (comments received on Jan. 1, Jan. 2, Jan. 4, Feb. 22, 2002)
3. Klaus Winkel (Denmark) – (comments received on Jan. 7, 2002)
4. Ann Waters-Bayer (NGOC) – (comments received on Jan. 22, 2002)
5. Jacques Ekebil (FAO) – (comments received on Feb. 11, Feb. 13, Feb. 27)
6. Jonathan Conly (US) - (comments received and forwarded by F. Reifschneider on Mar. 15, 2002)

Their comments and suggestions can be found in the ExCo web site. Copies will be made available to the WGSC members.

**List of Individuals Suggested for Membership in the WGSC<sup>1</sup>**

**Bruce Alberts** – Nobel Laureate (Biology); President of the US National Academy of Sciences; Panel Member, 3<sup>rd</sup> CGIAR System Review

**M. Al-Kassas** – Professor, Faculty of Science, Cairo University; past Vice President of the ICSU – Scientific Committee of Problems of the Environment (SCOPE) and the President of IUCN (International Union for Conservation of Nature)

**Enric Banda** – Professor (Earth Sciences); ex-Secretary of Science and Technology, Spain; Secretary General, European Science Foundation; Member of the CGIAR ExCo Science Council Task Force

**Bo Bengtsson** – Former CIFOR Board Chair; Secretary, Secretariat of the 3<sup>rd</sup> CGIAR System Review

**Rob Bertram** – Chief, Multilateral programs Division, CEGAD, USAID

**Klaas Jan Beek** – Professor, International Institute for Aerospace Survey and Earth Sciences, The Netherlands; Board Chair of IWMI; Former Rector of ITC, The Netherlands

**Christopher Chetsanga** – Director General of the Scientific and Industrial Research and Development Centre (SIRDC); Former Pro-Vice Chancellor of the University of Zimbabwe

**James Cook** – Professor/Scientist and Endowed Chair in Wheat, Washington State University; former Chief Scientist, USDA National Research Initiative Competitive Grants Program; former member of the CGIAR Science Partnership Committee

**Elizabeth Dennis** – Chief Research Scientist, CSIRO Plant Industry, Fellow of the Australian Academies of Science and Technological Sciences and Engineering

**Peter Doherty** – Nobel Laureate; Former ILRAD Board member

**Nasrat R Fadda**, Ex-Director General of ICARDA

**Mohamed Hag Ali Hassan** – Professor, Khartoum University; Executive Secretary, Third World Academy of Sciences (TWAS); Secretary General – Third World Network of Scientific Organizations (TWNSO)

---

<sup>1</sup> The list includes names suggested by ExCo members and those identified through the CGIAR Secretariat's Candidate Database

**Lauritz Holmnielsen** – Co-Chair of SC Task Force; CIAT Board Chair

**Jane Lubchenko** – President of IUBS

**Lydia Makhubu** – Professor, University of Swaziland; President, Third World Organization for Women in Science (TWOWS); Former member of CGIAR Science Partnership Committee

**Claire Marte** – Director of Research, SEAFDEC, and President of the Asian Fisheries Society

**Ragunath Mashelkar** – Director General, Indian Council of Scientific and Industrial Research (CSIR)

**Alex McCalla** – Professor, UC Davis; Board Chair, CIMMYT; Former TAC Chair

**Yoriko Meguro** – Professor, Department of Sociology, Sophia University, Japan; Former member of CIFOR Board

**Goverdhan Mehta** – President Indian National Science Academy; Director Indian Institute of Science, Bangalore, India; Member Executive Board ICSU.

**Mohamed A Nour** – Ex-Director General of ICARDA

**Fernando Perez** – President of FAPESP, the National Science Foundation of Sao Paulo State, Brazil.

**Jules Pretty**

**Roelof Rabbinge** – Professor, Department of Plant Production Systems Wageningen Agricultural University, The Netherlands; Former IRRI Board Chair

**C.N.R. Rao** – Linus Pauling Research Professor; Honorary President, Jawaharlal Nehru Centre for Advanced Scientific Research; President, TWAS

**Sally Rockey** – Deputy Administrator for Competitive Research Grants and Awards Management, CREES, USDA

**Thomas Rosswall** – Executive Director, ICSU; former Executive Director, IFS

**Mandivamba Rukuni** – Professor of Agricultural Economics at the University of Zimbabwe, Dean of the Faculty of Agriculture; Program Director for Africa of the Kellogg Foundation.

**Farida Habib Shah** – Member, Executive Board, Third World Organization for Women in Science (TWOWS)

**Abdel Majid Slama** – Director of NENA Division of IFAD

**M.S. Swaminathan** – Chairman, MSS Research Foundation; Chair, CGIAR Genetic Resources Policy Committee; Former IRRI Director General

**Jean-Marc von der Weid**

**Mohamed Zehni** – Ex-Director of Production and Protection Division of the FAO